JIMMY PAYNE:  
THE FORGOTTEN MR. AMERICA

How happy is the blameless Vestal’s lot? 
The world forgetting, by the world forgot.¹ 
~ Alexander Pope

John Fair
Georgia College and State University & 
The University of Texas at Austin

Shortly after World War II, the enterprising brothers of iron, Joe and Ben Weider of Montreal, formed the International Federation of Bodybuilders (IFBB) to challenge the erstwhile authority of the Amateur Athletic Union (AAU) and its chief benefactor/power broker in weightlifting, Bob Hoffman of York, Pennsylvania. Although the AAU had sanctioned the world’s most prestigious physique competition, the Mr. America Contest, since 1939, the Weiders sought to capitalize on the title by sponsoring a rival event with cash incentives. In 1949 that contest was won by Alan Stephan, the popular 1946 AAU Mr. America, and accompanied by much fanfare and ensuing endorsements by Stephan of Weider products. The 1950 IFBB winner, however, Jimmy Payne, of Oakland, California, received almost no publicity from the Weider organization. In fact, it provided far greater media exposure for the 1950 AAU Mr. America, John Farbotnik, although Payne, by virtue of his splendid physique, was also a deserving champion.² Indeed, no compilation of Mr. America titleholders by any federation or magazine over the past sixty years recognizes Payne’s 1950 victory.³ Even an official list furnished by Tony Blinn of the IFBB in 2008, at the behest of Ben Weider, does not include Payne.⁴ That the IFBB strangely stopped appearing in Weider publications for nearly a decade and that this disappearance is unaccounted for in their autobiography a half century later suggests a connection between the two lacunae with implications that focus more broadly on the evolution of iron game politics in the 1950s.⁵

Jimmy Payne was born on 3 May 1926, to a Jewish father (Jashmin Jasven) and an Italian Catholic mother in Oakland. When his parents separated and his mother remarried, he took the surname of his step-father. At age 13 Jimmy fractured his skull from falling off a banister at school and was unconscious for four days. Critical to his recovery were the skills he acquired in hand balancing and gymnastics (especially ring work) from watching others at a local playground. The Oakland area was a hotbed of physical culture, and Jimmy became a bodybuilder upon joining Carl Cathy’s gym and later Jack LaLanne’s studio where he, along with Steve Reeves, received personal instruction from Clem Poechman. At nearby Neptune Beach—an entertainment resort that featured a dance hall, picnic grounds, swimming pools, and a scenic railway—Payne engaged in hand balancing acts with LaLanne and Oakland gym owner Ed Yarick. Entering the Navy in 1943, he met Oregon bodybuilder
Sam Loprinzi, who was a barbell instructor at Treasure Island, a major embarkation point for men being shipped overseas. Loprinzi had, according to Payne, the first barbell gym in the service. Owing to his background in wrestling and boxing from school and his association with Loprinzi, with whom he did hand balancing and barbell work, Payne became a physical trainer in the service. Upon discharge he opened his own health studio with bodybuilder Norman Marks and started entering weightlifting meets and doing hand balancing stunts. According to Alyce Stagg, Yarick’s wife and a strength athlete in her own right, Jimmy and LaLanne “worked up a sensational act” and were featured at many shows in the bay area.6

Occasionally he and LaLanne would drive nearly four hundred miles to Muscle Beach where “we would perform on the beach all day and go to the Brown Derby and other clubs in Hollywood at night to drink. Jack put away quite a few.” In 1950, the same year he won the America crown, Payne worked as a lifeguard, bartender, and entertainer in Sonoma County. “In those days, the Russian River was the place to go, people came from all over the world, and the river was packed with nightclub. I did shows all over out there,” he recalls. Later he did nightclub work in San Francisco. Equally adept at muscle control as he was at hand balancing, he was a much sought after emcee, comedian, and tap dancer. But he did not sing. Payne recalls that he

worked in some pretty tough places that were both topless and bottomless. I worked on Broadway in San Francisco when it was amateur night for strippers. I worked with Tempest Storm, Lily St. Cyr, Candy Cane, Sugar, Tassel-twirling Tammy from Big T Texas, and Satin Doll. I never worked with Gypsy Rose Lee. Good strippers didn’t show everything. There was no vulgarity. Their acts were suggestive and full of innuendo.7

In the tradition of vaudeville physical culturists, Payne was very versatile, “unlike the current physique guys who can do nothing more than show muscles,” he says. His muscles were functional. Although he then weighed only 145 pounds, he states that he could press 245, snatch 210, and clean and jerk 280 pounds, enough to have earned him third place as a lightweight at the 1951 world championships in Milan. He also claims a squat of 325 pounds, a deadlift of 500, and that on his fifty-second birthday he did fifty-one handstand dips to surpass the mark of thirty-five set by Jack LaLanne. Arguably Payne’s most notable feats, however, were in wrist-wrestling where he was four-time lightweight champion and emceed the World Wrist-wrestling Championships for many years in nearby Petaluma for ABC’s Wide World of Sports. In the early 1970s, as a publicity stunt, Payne recalls that he wrist-wrestled the young Arnold Schwarzenegger who outweighed him by about eighty pounds. When asked how he did, Payne replied, “I whipped his ass.”8

Like most early bodybuilders, Payne considered the development of a pleasing physique to be a byproduct of training for other kinds of athletic pursuits and not an end in itself. Payne started to enter physique contests in 1945, along with LaLanne, who was nearly twelve years his senior and to some extent his role model and alter ego. Jack was even best man at Payne’s wedding. Both were short in stature, athletically gifted, and full of energy. Jimmy appeared to have a better physique, good enough to become a Mr. America. “He has a beautifully proportioned body, with excellent muscular definition, and looks good even besides [sic] men almost twice as big as he is,” observed Stagg in 1948.9 George Jowett, in a 1949 article entitled “Problems of the Short Man,” also noted Payne’s short stature, but “he did not let height disturb his molding a classical physique. Jimmy stands 5’ 5” in height, but his weight trained body is so perfectly proportioned that he gives the illusion of being much taller.”10 LaLanne, at 5’ 7”, was only runner-up at Walt Baptiste’s Professional Mr. America Contest in 1954 and never entered an AAU Mr. America Contest, yet he attracted seemingly endless coverage in all the leading muscle magazines, including twelve covers. According to Payne, Jack “did not look good under lights, but he had the best beach body and was the best all around performer.” Payne also believed that Clarence Ross, the 1945 AAU Mr. America, “was the best.” In 1947 Payne beat future Mr. America Jack Delinger to win the Mr. Northern California Contest and placed third in Baptiste’s professional contests in 1948 and 1949.11

By this time the Weider brothers also decided to adopt professionalism to advance their standing in the iron game. In a bold move to exploit and perhaps even appropriate the image of the nation’s leading bodybuilding event, they launched their own version of a Mr. America Contest under the auspices of the IFBB. “Cash for Mr. America, Money! Money! Money!” was the
Like many bodybuilders in the early twentieth century, Payne was an “all-rounder,” who built his physique through a combination of competitive weightlifting, bodybuilding training, and hand balancing. He and Jack LaLanne even worked together as a professional hand balancing team.

headline of a 1948 Muscle Power article criticizing the AAU for its old fogey ways and challenging it “to come out of its shell and be modern...If the A.A.U. would give a thousand simoleons, the Mr. America who got it could start something.” And an abolition of the one year winning limit, it argued, would provide more incentive for bodybuilders. [Editors’ note: The argument that allowing bodybuilders to win a contest for more than one year was sound, and proof arrived in the years after 1965 when the Mr. Olympia Contest was created with “repeat winners” being one of the main reasons for the new event.] On 16 November 1948, at the Roosevelt Auditorium in New York, Alan Stephan, already AAU Mr. America of 1946, won the IFBB title of Mr. America of 1949, a 40-inch trophy, $250 cash, and a free trip to Miami. According to Weider reporter Leo Gaudreau, Stephan’s muscular exhibition was greeted with “a continuous round of applause and cheering from an enthusiastic house that was packed to the walls.” Interestingly the second and third place finishers were French Canadians, Joffre L’Heureux and Leo Robert respectively, as was the winner of the short men’s class, Ed Theriault. Johnny Icino of New York City won the IFBB Jr. Mr. America Contest. Clarence Ross, so-called “King of Bodybuilders,” did not compete, but his guest posing routine was the highlight of the show. “Ancient Greece had nothing like this,” exclaimed Gaudreau. Although it was not yet possible for the fledgling IFBB to follow up its Mr. America Contest with a Mr. Universe competition, it did present a Mr. North America Contest in New York City in April 1949 where Ross claimed a $1,000 prize for defeating some of the best men on the continent. Weider editor Barton Horvath called it the “GREATEST EVENT OF THEM ALL!”

Despite his high placement in previous California physique contests, Jimmy received scant coverage in Weider magazines prior to the 1950 IFBB Mr. America Contest. It began with Alyce Stagg’s 1948 feature article in Your Physique which introduced him to a national audience as a “Versatile Bodybuilder and Muscular Sensation” and a “West Coast Hercules!” Reader response was immediate and enthusiastic. To accommodate “numerous requests,” a later issue of Muscle Power reprinted a back view of Payne. “As you know, his story in [the] last issue [of] “Your Physique” created a sensation and immediately [he] became a popular star.” Thereafter, however, he received only incidental mention. At the 1949 Mr. California Contest, where he did not place, Payne is described as having “exceptional muscular definition,” but in a group picture with other contestants he appears under-sized and out-of-place. The “special reporter” at the 1949 Mr. USA Contest in Los Angeles placed him in “a select group” that included the likes of Clarence Ross, Steve Reeves, Walter Marcyan, George Eiferman, Floyd Page, Armand Tanny, Leo Stern, and John Grimek (who ultimately won), but he appears diminutive in a photograph with the not-too-tall Walt Baptiste. It did not seem to disturb Jimmy, however, that he did not receive greater exposure. “He has had many offers to travel with vaudeville troupes and circuses,” noted Alyce Stagg, “but being a married man with two children prefers to stay at home and work in his studio.” He kept a relatively low profile.

Meanwhile the Weiders were seeking a higher level of recognition. According to spokesman Earle Liederman, the IFBB was sponsoring nineteen shows in 1949 and was planning thirty-one for the following year, including three in California, four in the Midwest, two in
Florida, and ten overseas. "At that rate in 1951 we will have a show a week!" Eventually the Weiders aspired to invite champions representing all forty IFBB countries to New York "for the GREATEST SHOW EVER HELD" that would "pack Madison Square Garden." As a means to this end Ben Weider was "on the go again" in early 1950

this time off to England to set up agencies for Weider Publications and equipment. As usual Ben hopped a fast plane—the favorite mode of transportation of busy executives. Ben will be gone for about six weeks and when he returns you can be sure that the Weider Enterprises will be firmly entrenched in England. This proves how quickly the same sincere policy which has made the Weider Company the most successful and liked in America is spreading to other shores.21

Thus Ben was overseas promoting the IFBB as time approached for the 1950 Mr. America Contest in Oakland. Nevertheless, according to Liederman, it was "going to be an extremely important event and ALL the best men are invited—most have already said they would appear." Liederman hoped that, owing to AAU restrictions on professionalism, many bodybuilders, including previous Mr. Americas, would take part in the contest. Liederman deemed the participation of 1949 AAU Mr. America, Jack Delinger, particularly desirable.22

Neither Delinger nor any other previous Mr. Americas showed up. In fact, the leading contestants were from the Bay Area. Details are sketchy, but the contest was directed by West Coast photographer Russ Warner for the Weiders on 17 February at Oakland Auditorium with Ed Theriault as guest pose. Jimmy Payne recalls it was a packed house with perhaps as many as 1,000 fans and about a dozen contestants, virtually all of whom were Californians. But the quality of physiques was high, with Phil Courtois placing second, Norman Marks third, Vince Gironda fourth, and Bob McCune fifth.

I won $180 and didn't get the publicity I should have got. But I got the money, and that mattered more to me at the time. I had to ask Warner for the mon-

ey. Warner said 'fuck you,' so I went for him. One of Joe's men held me back, and Joe gave me a check. I don't think Joe wanted me to win. He probably wanted Marks or Gironda, but the audience had a great impact and really favored me. I was proud that I won because I was small and it showed that I could accomplish something.23

Remarkably, the Mr. America Contest and its winner received almost no recognition in Weider magazines. A picture of Payne with his trophy is tucked into an article entitled "I Gained 100 Pounds of Bodyweight" by Hollywood strongman Willis Reed in the July 1950 issue of Muscle Power, but it is accompanied by no text relating to his victory and superseded by a much larger photo of Phil Courtois and article at the front of the magazine as "a tribute to a great bodybuilder who achieves his greatest triumph after 20 years of weight training" for finishing second!24 Far more coverage was provided on the 1949 Mr. Armed Forces Contest in Honolulu and the AAU's Mr. Los Angeles Contest in 1950.25 When asked why so much more attention was devoted to AAU than IFBB physique contests of this era, Ben Weider responded puzzlingly that "there was no particular reason. It is just the way the journalist wrote it up and the information and photos that he supplied."26

A more likely reason for this omission and general lack of coverage of its own contests is that the Weider organization, though attracting some leading bodybuilders—Floyd Page, Marvin Eder, Armand Tanny, Abe Goldberg, Leo Robert, Stephan, and Ross—and such notables as Sig Klein, Hy Shaeffer, George Yacos, Tony Lanza, and Lon Hanagan as judges, was having second thoughts about divorcing itself from the American weightlifting establishment. The Weiders may have concluded that rather than continue a fight in which they were overmatched they should seek some sort of reconciliation which, at least, would allow them to play a role in both weightlifting and bodybuilding, even if it was not the leading role. In any case, increasingly favorable references to the AAU in Weider publications indicated that an accord might be in the offing. One even created a hypothetical scenario of the AAU and IFBB "blending in serene harmony."27 Negotiations ensued with Dietrich Wortmann, the national AAU weightlifting chairman. Then came the surprise announcement in the January 1950 issue of Your Physique that the two bodies had "ironed out their difficulties" and would henceforth
“cooperate fully with each other.” The Weiders admitted fault in failing to recognize the distinction between amateur and professional, thereby jeopardizing the eligibility of American athletes in international competition. Though still based in Canada, they claimed to have

feelings of patriotism as much as the next guy. We desire, as much as the other fellow, to see the USA remain TOP DOG in the world of weights. So many thousands of young men were entering in physique competitions that we saw we were endangering the supply of future championship material. That we should have foreseen this eventuality is a reproach which could be flung at us, but we HONESTLY believed that so long as a man did not ACCEPT a money prize, then he retained his amateur status.28

Even more surprising was the Weiders’ willingness to reach an accord with arch enemy Bob Hoffman whose "unostentatious generosity has provided the financial sinews of the American weightlifting teams. ... It is time someone else helped.” To this end they intended “to publish a magazine devoted entirely to COMPETITIVE LIFTING.”29 Especially in light of later perceptions of Joe Weider as the bodybuilder’s best friend, it seems remarkable that he and his brother seemed so eager to redirect their energies behind weightlifting, the AAU, and Hoffman just when bodybuilding was starting to blossom as a separate sport. One explanation is that Joe Weider’s longtime love for weightlifting—the sport which originally brought him into the iron game and the sport which even now he prefers to discuss rather than bodybuilding—contributed to his willingness to offer the olive branch to people he believed had kept him out of weightlifting.

To prove their sincerity in launching this new initiative Weider publications featured an instructional article entitled “Your First Weightlifting Contest” that was highly supportive of AAU efforts to recruit new lifters and tributes to York strength stars John Grimek and Steve Stanko.30 Likewise Earle Liederman lauded the AAU Mr. Los Angeles Contest for 1950 as “a truly splendid show.”31 Although a separate publication devoted to competitive weightlifting never materialized, a sizable monthly weightlifting news section, edited by Charles A. Smith, a member of the New York (Metropolitan) AAU, soon appeared in Muscle Power, which was eventually dubbed “two magazines in one.” Through his international connections, Smith attracted a group of weightlifting experts and Muscle Power became a leading source of information and inspiration for aspiring lifters in the 1950s. Noticeably understated were articles or announcements about Weider shows (chiefly Mr. Montreal and Mr. Canada), and the IFBB logo appeared only on pictures of winners mounted on pedestals leftover from the 1940s. Most striking, in light of the absent coverage of the 1950 IFBB Mr. America Contest was the attention lavished by Weider magazines on the AAU Mr. America Contest, its 1950 winner John Farbotnik, and his future plans. Liederman describes Farbotnik as an “anatomical sensation” and “the most sensational poseur these old optics have ever seen,” and Charles Smith, despite his partiality towards black bodybuilder Melvin Wells, recognized that Farbotnik was “as good a man to ever wear the crown.”32 Further evidence of the power of the AAU Mr. America title and its influence on the Weiders is their frequent use of it to increase the appeal of their magazines and sale of their products. The April 1950 cover of Your Physique featured four AAU Mr. Americas, for instance, and the inside back cover displayed one of them (Ross) making a pitch for “Y-O-U-R MR. AMERICA DE LUXE SPECIAL” barbell set. For all intents and purposes the IFBB was an anachronism.

In light of what appeared to be a meeting of minds and the contrite spirit displayed by the Weiders, it might seem surprising that dissension should set in so soon. However, beyond the fact that Hoffman still harbored a deep distrust of his commercial rivals and never subscribed to the IFBB/AAU accord, it was the ceaseless personal attacks of Harry Paschall on bodybuilders (and by implication the Weiders) in his monthly Strength & Health column that destroyed any possibility of ongoing, meaningful cooperation. In the August 1949 issue, for instance, Paschall pointed out that Weider-trained men were just “mirror athletes.” By contrast at least four of the six top men in that year’s AAU Mr. America Contest were “real strength athletes.”33 Joe responded to these jibes in a strongly worded article, “Getting It Off My Chest,” in which he defended bodybuilding, launched a personal attack on Paschall, and urged readers not to buy York magazines.34 Harry’s counterblast was classic Paschall:

Politics makes strange bedfellows. A year ago Weedy was hollering that the
A.A.U. was unfair to bodybuilders, who should be highly paid for their efforts in achieving biceps with a larger circumference than their heads. Now we find him all snuggled up to the A.A.U., using the well known Red tactics of infiltration. ... The plain facts are that the IFBB (Informal Brotherhood of Boobs) did not work out quite as well as Weedy expected, and now he is prospecting for gold on the other side of the street in the field of weightlifting.35

Obviously money was a factor in the Weiders’ sudden change of heart. It also seems clear—since Hoffman failed to rein in Paschall’s ad hominem broadsides against the Weiders and their bodybuilders—that he was unwilling to share either his influence over the iron sports or the money he made through such influence. Hoffman was not given to sharing. From the perspective of former Weider writer E. M. Orlick, “Hoffman got angry because he knew Weider was making money. There were things that Joe did that I didn’t approve of, but he had as much right to make money as Hoffman.”36

Neither side gave quarter as the feud was waged through months of mud-slinging articles, but the Weider camp, perhaps as the under-dog, adopted a more philosophical approach and periodically expressed interest in a settlement. For example, in one article, after tracing the roots of their conflict back to his setting up headquarters in Jersey City, the founding of his second magazine (Muscle Power), and his earliest challenge to AAU supremacy—all in 1946—Joe offered in the summer of 1950 to “bury the hatchet” and “work hand in hand” with his York rivals. “Thousands will benefit if we swallow our pride and extend the hand of friendship and forgiveness to each other.” Indeed Orlick recalls that “Joe never talked ill of Hoffman. I always thought it was Bob who had the ill feelings.”37 Indeed this gesture of cordiality was not reciprocated, and the level of rhetoric only escalated.

Few could have predicted that their quarrel would persist for decades. Throughout this long struggle for power the AAU Mr. America Contest and its winners were vigorously exploited by both sides for commercial and political advantage. One of the latter (George Eiferman), in addition to endorsing York products, admitted to Hoffman that he was training to beat Clancy Ross in the 1948 Mr. U.S.A. contest. “He is representing Weider and if I can beat him it will help a lot I guess—wont it—[sic]”38 Though stating in a Your Physique article that he was “NOBODY’S PUPIL,” Alan Stephan declared that “the Weider system incorporated all the exercise principles that I personally used to develop my own body, and which I teach to my pupils.”39 But Hoffman claimed credit for all Mr. Americas through 1949, insisting they had “trained with York equipment and training methods. ... Three highly publicized Mr. Americas, Clarence Ross, Alan Stephan and Steve Reeves were York barbell men and not publicized by and claimed as pupils by another barbell company, UNTIL THEY HAD WON THE MR. AMERICA CROWNS.”40 Safe to say, both sides exaggerated greatly in trying to tap maximum publicity from bodybuilding’s most valuable commodity.

Any possibility of consensus and good will, however, broke down when John Farbotnik was featured in a Muscle Power article, which he said he neither approved and for which he said he was never compensated. It stated that the workouts which led to his victory were “almost identical to the Weider System.”41 In a Strength & Health rebuttal, Farbotnik took immediate offence to the use of his name and photographs.

I have neither seen nor used a Weider barbell or Weider course. My first training equipment consisted of York super cables and cable courses written by Bob Hoffman. At Fritsche’s Gym we used nothing but Milo weights which Bob Hoffman had bought out some time earlier. If my course is so similar to that of Weider’s then Weider is using York training methods.42

Further confirmation of the Weiders’ villainy, according to Hoffman, was evident from the fracas surrounding Farbotnik’s victory at the amateur Mr. World Contest held in Paris with the world weightlifting championships in October 1950. When Reg Park, Mr. Britain, was disqualified because he had competed in a professional (Weider) show a month earlier in New York, he protested by claiming (with evidence obtained from Weider) that Farbotnik had also violated amateur rules. Turbulent scenes, involving Park’s parents and the French police followed, and Park’s disqualification was sustained by the International Weightlifting Federation. But without him, Farbotnik had virtually no competition. As Hoffman put it, “the entries were not as extraordinary as those in the major American A.A.U. physique contest.43 Mr. World meant far less in real terms than Mr.
America.” It was an empty title.

Indeed the Mr. America title was at that time the hottest commodity in the iron game, and the Weiders continued to use Mr. America iconography and AAU winners through the 1950s, even launching and relaunching a magazine called Mr. America in 1952 and 1958. What seems remarkable is that they made no attempt to rejuvenate the IFBB or their own Mr. America Contest during these years. Even in reports of the Mr. Montreal and Mr. Canada contests they continued to administer in the 1950s any mention of IFBB sponsorship is conspicuously absent. Notwithstanding the Weiders’ inability to break the York hold on the AAU, Joe remained true to his agreement with Wortmann and announced in the April 1952 issue of Your Physique that during the previous year he had donated about $2,000 to the Olympic Weightlifting Team Fund from physique contest profits. The likely motive behind this seemingly irrational display of generosity was not so much to support American weightlifting as to demonstrate that the sport did not have to be completely dependent on Hofman. In a veiled reference to York, he argued that his bodybuilding shows could not only free the AAU but liberate its athletes from “certain controls” wielded by powerful influences in National weightlifting circles. Only by making our weightlifters and our weightlifting teams completely financially independent can these controlling bonds be shattered. It is not fair to them, or to the people of America that certain dictatorial policies, nourished and condoned solely because of need of private support of our teams, should relegate these sterling athletes to a serf basis. They must not be hampered by restrictions of any sort. ... Therefore, next month I am writing an article which sets down a plan which ... will make our weightlifting teams 100% self sufficient, self respecting and free to act ... to select their coach, trainers and deserving team members, without regard to anyone except those who believe in them the most ... the American Public.

What this editorial shows is that Joe, in the words of Harry Paschall, was still “prospecting for gold on the other side of the street” and that the financial infrastructure of weightlifting was still the mainspring of power in the sport. However, no plan that would enable him to stake a claim on American weightlifting through his infant bodybuilding enterprises materialized in any subsequent issue of Your Physique. Joe simply lacked the resources from his magazines and “Mr. America Barbell Company” to mount an assault on fortress York, whose corporate assets had been growing since the 1930s. Thus in a 1954 editorial in Muscle Builder, Ben Weider displays all the signs of a true believer by encouraging prospective competitors to join the AAU and enter its contests.

Although the IFBB remained virtually defunct during these years, Ben later conveys the impression in Brothers of Iron that he was busily waging a kind of David vs. Goliath struggle against the National Amateur Bodybuilding Association (NABBA) and Oscar Heidenstam who conducted the annual Mr. Universe Contest in Britain. The conflict went far beyond Britain, because the NABBA was a sort of bodybuilding extension of the British Empire, which in the early 1950s was still intact. In fact, wherever the British flag flew, over dozens of countries, colonies, and protectorates, bodybuilders took their cues from London-based NABBA. Through the 1950s, I would feel the long arm of Oscar Heidenstam and run into the NABBA wall in such farflung places as Malaya (now Malaysia), Thailand, Singapore, and British-controlled Caribbean Islands. ... But then, one by one, starting later in the ’50s, the British colonies gained their independence, and sports officials and athletes didn’t want to bow to London any more. ... When the political bonds with Britain were broken, the sun began to rise on the IFBB in the former British colonies.

However true it might be that Britain’s imperial sunset coincided with the international growth of the IFBB, it did not, with the notable exception of India (1947), gain full force until after the independence of Ghana in 1957. Nor does Ben’s story account for the long period of IFBB inactivity in the early to mid-1950s. Most importantly, he neglects to mention that Heidenstam was in
league with Hoffman, who was sending annual AAU Mr. America winners, including Jim Park, Ray Schaefer, and Ron Lacy, to compete in the Mr. Universe Contest in London.

A more likely scenario is that both Ben and Joe Weider, deprived of influence in AAU circles as well as in NABBA, had concluded by 1957 that they would never be given access to the inner circles of power and that they should simply revive the IFBB they had mothballed during their period of seeking rapprochement and go their own way. Another factor in such a decision had to have been the continuous editorial attacks in Harry Paschall’s words and cartoons. [Editors’ Note: These attacks sank to an all-time low in 1957, less than fifteen years after the Holocaust had ended, when in the September issue of Strength & Health, Paschall wrote about the Weiders, who were Jewish, that “you can take a kike out of the slums but you can never take the slums out of the kike.”] In any case, these mounting resentments came to a head in 1957 when Joe’s entrant to the Mr. Universe Contest, Doug Strohl of Santa Monica, placed only fourth in his height class to overall winner John Lees of England, while Lacy placed first in his class. In a Muscle Builder “expose” Joe declared:

The flawless judging, the sincerity and honesty which made the Mr. Universe Contests the most important physique events in the world, now appear to be things of the past. After what took place at the 1957 event, it is difficult to believe that future contests warrant much consideration. From this time on, bodybuilders will wonder if the winner was really the winner, or merely a hand picked wearer of the crown.

Just as the misuse of officiating powers has made the Mr. America title a farce with the winner so frequently not being the best man, so does it now appear that in the future the Mr. Universe title will mean little as far as the selection of the best man is concerned.

It was obvious to Weider that Strohl, who “looked the part of a bronzed statue come to life,” was “the popular and rightful choice” of the audience. Even London gym owner Lou Ravelle observed in the generally independent magazine Iron Man that Lees received only a “tepid ovation” and that Strohl “got the biggest ovation in the show and many thought he would win.” British reports, on the other hand, barely mention Strohl. In fact, W. A. Pullum, editor of Health & Strength, noted that “the American standard wasn’t so good generally as in most previous years,” and NABBA founder, D. G. Johnson, observed that Lees, “before the biggest-ever crowd of delighted fans” at the Coliseum “brought off a magnificent win” and would take “his rightful place among the bodybuilding ‘greats.” Clearly there was a growing differential between the Weiders, who were attempting to become part of the international scene, and the “imperial” powers that be. Despite Ben’s efforts to enlist the cooperation of Heidenstam and those of Joe, who even entered the 1951 Mr. Universe Contest to ingratiate himself to the English, their penchant for professionalism could only have reinforced the erstwhile amateur bonds of their adversaries which were rooted in the 1940s and blocked the way to any IFBB revival.

Although NABBA constituted a major obstacle for Ben’s dreams of international expansion, it was a domestic event that eventually provided the Weiders with moral justification to challenge the AAU and eventually NABBA. At an impromptu Mr. Universe Contest staged at Virginia Beach by the local Jr. Chamber of Commerce in June of 1956, Hoffman, acting in the capacity of Vice President of the AAU Weightlifting Committee and head judge, rigged the results in order to secure the victory of his favorite contestant, Steve Klisanin. Critical to this outcome was Hoffman’s exclusion of Barton Horvath, a Weider editor, on the second night of judging. A full expose of Hoffman’s conduct followed in Muscle Builder. “For far too long,” claimed Horvath, “Hoffman had bellowed his way into the limelight of AAU bodybuilding contests, usurping powers never officially delegated to him in a series of ludicrous attempts to establish himself as the czar of the muscle world.” As further proof that Hoffman had “manipulated” the outcome, Horvath provided pictures comparing the physiques of Klisanin and runner-up Ray Schaefer with other contestants as well as copies of score sheets (made available by contest promoters).

Letters from readers of Weider magazines indicate that Hoffman’s arrogation of authority at Virginia Beach was becoming a cause celebre and that many bodybuilders formerly supportive of York and the AAU were being swayed by Horvath’s evidence. “Each day,” observed Joe, “we receive letters, telephone calls and bits of information from many sources which point to a Hoffman dynasty and a dictatorial rule.” Weider kept
the pot boiling over the next year by publishing more
score cards and sending letters (via Horvath) to National
Weightlifting Chairman Clarence Johnson and Nation­
al AAU President Carl Hansen, requesting an investiga­
tion of Hoffman's conduct. “One rumor has it Mr. John­
son, that you are merely a puppet official and that Hoff­
man pulls the strings while you dance to his tune,” wrote
Horvath when he received no response.57 While the over­
all impact of this incident on opinion in muscledom is
uncertain, the message for the Weiders could not have
been clearer.

Another factor leading to the revival of the IFBB
was the increased involvement by the late fifties of
Oscar State, an English schoolmaster from Twickenham
who was a founder of NABBA, secretary of the British
Amateur Weight Lifters Association (BAWLA) after
World War II, and later secretary of the International
Weightlifting Federation (IWF) from 1960 to 1976.58
State was also a long-time adversary of Heidenstam and
shared some of the same cultural bonds as the Weiders.
Not unlike the Weiders, he was a controversial figure
and somewhat out of step with officialdom. Though he
was primarily responsible for staging the weightlifting
events at the 1948 Olympics and the Mr. Universe Con­
test of that year (prior to the formation of NABBA),
State was soon dismissed as BAWLA secretary and then
from its executive committee in 1953, for “carrying
tales,” according to Oscar Heidenstam. “He has always
had a grievance against us.” What Heidenstam likely
meant by “carrying tales” is that State was sharing insid­
er information with the Weiders. It is hardly coinciden­
tal that State first appears on the masthead of the June
1953 issue of Muscle Power as European Editor.59 This
connection with professionalism, notes former IWF
President Gottfried Schodl, nearly denied the interna­
tional secretariat to State in 1960 when French officials
argued that he had “received cash … for his announcing
activity in various international contests and qualified
therefore [as] a professional who should not be allowed
to attend a congress for amateurs.” Resentments over
Oscar’s appointment, his imperial manner, and North
American connections lingered long even though his
organizational skills and knowledge of the sport were
widely acknowledged. Eventually, as Schodl observes:

Oscar State found the international par­
quet a bit too slippery. He slipped—and
fell. Stiff rather than pliable by nature,
he was wont to think in terms of strict
paragraphs without leaving room for
any imagination. His stubbornness—
despite all his hard work and love for
sports administration—had inevitably
led to a significant decline in the num­
ber of his friends over the years. With
16 years of service behind him, in Mon­
treal Oscar State had to realize with a
petrified face that only 24 countries con­
sidered him as their preferred candidate
for General Secretary.60

What Schodl fails to mention is that the election of Hun­
garian Tamas Ajan as State’s successor coincided with
the burgeoning dominance of the Eastern Bloc countries
on the platform as well as in the political sphere. How­
ever, during his years as IWF Secretary, State had been
able to establish international links for the Weiders, write
feature articles for their magazines, and provide critical
behind-the-scenes guidance.

For example, in 1970 State drew up a constitu­
tion for the IFBB and provided political leverage for its
admittance to the General Association of International
Sports Federations (GAISF) which enabled the Weiders
to establish international hegemony over the sport of
bodybuilding. Upon becoming secretary of the GAISF,
Oscar helped establish links for the Weiders with the
International Olympic Committee and nurture Ben’s
dream of making bodybuilding an Olympic event.
“Oscar was a rather cool, reserved individual,” recalls
Ben in the Weider autobiography, “and our relationship
took a long time to ripen. After we met I had no idea that
Oscar would be the best friend I ever had, outside my
family.” An entire chapter entitled “Oscar’s Golden
Key,” with an accompanying eulogy, is dedicated to
State. It was no exaggeration for Ben to say that “with­
out him there would be less of a story to tell.”61 The
great weight of State’s confidence and mentoring was
most assuredly having an impact on the Weiders by the
late 1950s. Consequently their criticisms of AAU body­
building steadily escalated.

Then in the fall of 1958 the Weiders made their
fateful move, announcing that the International Federa­
tion of Bodybuilders would stage a combined Mr. Amer­
ica, Mr. Universe, Mr. Canada, and World’s Most Mus­
cular Man Contest on 25 January 1959, in Montreal. “To
earn a place in either of these gala strength affairs is like
playing in the World Series or driving at Indianapolis,”
Muscle Builder hyperbolized. “It’s the top attainment
for the bodybuilder.” It was to represent a “new concep­
tion in physique contests” whereby the IFBB would fund
three days hotel stay and board for non-Montreal residents and unlimited free training facilities. Furthermore, in what was alleged to be an obvious contrast to AAU/NABBA judging, “all will get fair and impartial treatment throughout! Judging will be based on muscularity, shape, and symmetry—and on nothing else!” Many publicity ensued for the winners, Mr. America Chuck Sipes and Mr. Universe Eddie Silvestre, both of whom were soon prominently featured on covers and in articles of Weider publications. “Mr. America ‘Goes Weider’ All The Way” was the title of an article in the August 1959 issue of Muscle Builder that explained how Sipes built his magnificent physique with Weider principles of super-sets, flushing methods, and peak contraction movements. No mention was made of any previous IFBB Mr. Americas.

Emboldened by their successful revival, the Weiders moved forward on two fronts to establish a new tradition. Ben embarked on an international friendship tour, combined with a wedding trip with the former Huguette Drouin, to London, Paris, Rome, and Israel to publicize the IFBB and its new contests. It was reminiscent of his recruitment visits to “twenty-two countries” in the spring of 1947 where he reportedly created IFBB offices in France and South Africa. Additionally, in announcing the combined America/Universe contest for 1960, declared that it would be “the greatest spectacle of muscle and might since the days of the Roman gladiators” and that judging criteria, unlike AAU contests, would be based solely on muscularity.

You don’t have to prove your athleticism by running the mile—playing a game of tennis—swimming the back-stroke. You are not required to throw the javelin—wrestle—you don’t have to lift a ton of weights to prove that you’re a worthy candidate for championship.

No one will examine your educational background to see if you had a 98.6 average in high school—you’ll not be asked to recite a literary selection to prove that you can speak intelligently—no one will examine your mouth to see if you have all 32 teeth.

The contest is to determine who shall win the various titles by reason of his superior physique ... no other reason is or should be valid! And that’s why the I.F.B.B. was organized."

Weider contended that it was owing to these kinds of “odoriferous shenanigans” that “the country’s best-built men now enter the Mr. America contest held each year in Montreal in conjunction with the Mr. Universe contest.” This latter scenario hardly accorded to reality, as the victory of Gene Shuey, one of the sport’s lesser lights in 1960 attests, but the Weiders did eventually attract Larry Scott, who refused to compete in the AAU version after winning the Mr. California title in 1960, and went on to become IFBB Mr. America (1962), Mr. Universe (1964), Mr. Olympia (1965 and 1966), and one of the brightest stars in the bodybuilding firmament.

In the early 1960s, Jimmy Payne and his wife, Jane, began appearing in a weekly TV program called Mr. and Mrs. America. Aimed at children, the show featured exercises named for animals and a recurring guest was “Miss Americalf.” Payne lifted the growing calf on his shoulders, as did Milo of Ancient Greece.
Meanwhile memories of earlier IFBB Mr. Americas diminished amidst the maelstrom of high muscle politics. While pictures and occasional articles on Alan Stephan persisted into the late 1950s, only occasionally did images, usually stock photographs, of Payne surface but with no further identification beyond that of Professional Mr. America. A 1952 Muscle Power article entitled “Why Some Develop Muscles Faster Than Others” for instance, features a full page picture of Payne, but he is disembodied from the text which employs such AAU Mr. Americas as Clarence Ross, Alan Stephan, John Grimek, Steve Reeves, George Eiferman, Roy Hilligen, and other higher profile figures to illustrate the story line. Readers were apt to wonder who Payne really was and even confuse him with Floyd Page, who won Baptiste’s Professional Mr. America Contest in 1948 and was featured prominently in Weider magazines in the 1950s. Ironically, the fullest coverage Payne received for the first six years after his Mr. America victory was a cover photo and related short story in a 1953 issue of Strength & Health, but with no mention of his affiliation with the hated Weider organization. “I didn’t care what Hoffman thought,” responded former managing editor Jim Murray when asked how he was able to get away with it. “Payne had a good physique.” [Editors’ note: Even so, the fact that Murray worked for York could have possibly influenced the decision to omit the IFBB connection.] It also probably helped that few at York could remember his IFBB victory. Finally a full-fledged story on Payne, with numerous illustrations appeared in the March 1957 issue of Muscle Builder, but its main purpose was to refute an unintentionally strange article by John Grimek in Strength & Health condemning the use of unusual or “unnatural” exercises as harmful to one’s muscles and joints. The Muscle Builder article responded sarcastically that Payne, who operated his own gymnasium in San Pablo, California, and drove a $6,000 Jaguar, “used nothing but ‘unnatural’ exercise to reach his present position in the barbell game, his athletic ability, and financial success.” Although his 1950 title is mentioned in passing, no reference is made to the IFBB, and it appears that the sole thrust of the article was to use Payne as a weapon in the ongoing struggle with York to win the hearts and minds of bodybuilders after the Virginia Beach fiasco.

Undoubtedly Payne could attribute much of his development to versatile training and the athletic feats he was able to perform. Yet he adhered to a developmental philosophy more akin to that adopted by the AAU Mr. America Contest in the 1950s, which stressed functional muscles, rather than the revived IFBB standard where “superior physique” and “no other reason” determined title winners. Indeed Payne did more to promote a traditional Mr. America image beyond the contest itself than most other champions. “I believe that it is the quality of the muscle that counts and not size,” he argued. A big bicep “sure looks good, but what can you do with it?” For his son and daughter, aged two years and three weeks in 1948, he had high aspirations—that they become the Mr. America and the Miss America of 1968, suggesting a link with the annual Atlantic City pageant which, through the efforts of promoter Lenora Slaughter, was no longer just a body show. In the meantime, owing to his having failed to receive the kinds of publicity afforded to AAU Mr. Americas and AAU weightlifting by the Weider organization during the same period, he was never able to maximize his title or fully exploit it for commercial gain.

Only in the early 1960s did an opportunity arise outside the Weider network to capitalize on his fame through a template furnished by his lifelong boon companion Jack LaLanne. A decade after Jack launched his highly successful television fitness series for women, Jimmy started a weekly family TV program called “Mr. and Mrs. America” with his wife Jane. It was featured in a much belated article in Muscle Builder with no political overtones that calls him “America’s most versatile athlete” whose talents surpass those of the great Jim Thorpe.

On the rings Jimmy works out like an Olympic star. He is a consummate artist on the high horizontal bar . . . the parallel bars . . . the trapeze. He is a champion weightlifter . . . an expert tumbler . . . a trampolinist of the first order . . . and he excels in diving, judo, wrestling, muscle control and all the track events at which Jim Thorpe was noted for!

He can perform a One-Finger Chin with each of his index fingers four times. He does a complete routine while suspended 400 to 500 feet above a crowd while fastened to a Helicopter. Still the author, Clem Poechman, Payne’s early trainer, makes no mention of him ever having won the Mr. America title. But Jimmy continued to get recognition elsewhere, being introduced as Mr. America when he
January 2012

Iron Game History

appeared on the “You Asked for It” and “Wide World of Sports” television shows and when he emceed the World Wristwrestling Championships in Petaluma. And his own televised program became a “Junior Mr. & Miss America Club,” sponsored by “Super-Strength Alcoa Wrap,” on which he led groups of children in such exercises as elephant squats, zebra steps, panther push-ups, rhino raises, and duck dips; and during which Jimmy lifted a calf on his shoulders (Milo of Crotona style) named Miss Americalf. That he was unable to transform this local exposure into a national medium owes to an ineffective marketing strategy. “LaLanne was smarter,” Payne admits. “He hit the women’s market. I did kids.” Yet he has no regrets. “Family always came first, and I’ve had to work to support four kids.” Indeed his greatest delight comes from children and having his great-granddaughter tell her friends that he was Mr. America. He gets “a real kick out of that. I’ve had a happy life.”

Payne’s absence from the limelight and consolation in simple pleasures may also be attributed to the complicated and inconsistent political strategy of the Weider brothers in the late 1940s and their stalled efforts to promote a Mr. America Contest that would rival that of the AAU. Their attempt to gain credibility by association and power by attaching monetary value to the title through their recently formed bodybuilding federation quickly broke down in 1950. Despite the impression conveyed by the Weiders in Brothers of Iron that the story of the IFBB was an unbroken chain of success, they promoted virtually no major contests from 1950 to 1959, searching instead—and in vain—for a way to work within the system in both weightlifting and bodybuilding.

This search led them to seek an accord with AAU Weightlifting Chairman Dietrich Wortmann, but besides his association with Bob Hoffman, Wortmann’s long association with amateur spott made it difficult for the Weiders to tack against the strong winds of amateurism which prevailed in the iron game at that time. As Payne rightly suspected, “the AAU was very tough on athletes in those days,” and the Weiders were “afraid of getting in trouble.” A change of strategy developed slowly, and only when it became obvious that any permeation of the existing power structure was effectively blocked by the influence wielded by Oscar Heidenstam over NABBA on the international level and Bob Hoffman over the AAU in America. A realization that something had to be done outside the existing order sprang most visibly from resentments over the incessant personal attacks by Harry Paschall as well as over the conduct of the officials at the AAU Virginia Beach Mr. Universe Contest in 1956 and the NABBA Mr. Universe Contest of 1957. Arguably, the most important agent of change was Oscar State and the subtle confidence and insider knowledge he provided. He was truly a deus ex machina—a “god from the machine”—for the Weider cause in the late 1950s as he laid the basis for the resurrection of the IFBB. Eventually, the recognition State was able to secure for the organization in the GAISF, along with the disintegration of the AAU power block and its nexus with NABBA, enabled the Weiders to dominate the sport by the 1960s and appropriate the Mr. America title in the late 1970s.

The chief casualty of these machinations was Jimmy Payne. While the IFBB lay dormant for nearly a decade, the Weiders continued to feature other fledgling physique stars (mostly Canadian) and AAU Mr. America champions to their mutual commercial advantage.

Although Payne never fully capitalized on his Mr. America victory he fathered four children and told author John Fair, who took this photo when Payne was seventy-eight, “I’ve had a happy life.”
Payne, however, was never able to exploit fully his own IFBB title. Unlike Alan Stephan, who was best known and heralded for his AAU amateur title, Payne’s professional title actually worked to his disadvantage as the Weiders strained to get in step with the amateur mainstream. Although this strategy delayed any possible hegemonic aspirations, they survived commercially and reemerged boldly at the end of the decade with a series of blockbuster contests—Mr. America (1959), Mr. Universe (1959), Mr. World (1962), and Mr. Olympia (1965) that would change the face of bodybuilding and eventually, with the star power of Arnold Schwarzenegger, provide the Weiders with a lock on the image of modern bodybuilding. In the meantime Jimmy Payne, lacking the promotional boost afforded to other Weider champions, faded into relative obscurity, while his friend and training partner, Jack LaLanne, went on to fame and fortune. Unheralded in his prime and denied by circumstances a place in bodybuilding’s heritage, Jimmy Payne became the “Forgotten Mr. America.”

NOTES:

2. Any uncertainty about who had the superior physique was probably resolved by Payne’s third-place finish to Farbricht and the legendary Vince Gironda at the Professional Mr. America Contest staged by Bay gym operator Walt Bepliste in 1951. “Professional Mr. America,” Your Physique 15 (September 1951), 7.
7. Interview with Payne. See also The Healdsburg Tribune, 18 & 19 February 2004; and the Santa Rosa Press Democrat, 20 March 2011, for an update.
8. Interview with Payne.
13. Leo Gaudreau, "Mr. America of 1949," Your Physique 10 (February 1949), 10, 18, 36.
29. Ibid.
36. Interview with Emmanuel Orlick, 14 December 1993, Brandywine, Maryland.
40. "Do You Know These Men?", Strength & Health 18 (January 1950), 29.
44. The first version of Mr. America was actually a continuation of Your Physique and ran from August to November of 1952. The latter version was published from January 1958 to March 1973.
47. Weider, Brothers of Iron, 134.
48. Harry Paschall, Strength & Health 19 (September 1957), 59.
50. Ibid.
53. For a broader perspective see John D. Fair, "Oscar Heidenstan, the Mr. Universe Contest, and the Amateur Ideal in British Bodybuilding," Twentieth Century British History (Fall, 2006).
60. Weider, Brothers of Iron, 135.
63. "Sensational Report on the International Federation of Body Builders," Your Physique 9 (May 1948), 26-27, 30-32. Ben later claims to have visited "27 countries on behalf of the IFBB" by 1950, but there is no follow up to this report of activity either in the Weider autobiography or their magazines. See Weider, Brothers of Iron, 133.
64. "Mammoth Mr. Universe—Mr. America Contest!" Muscle Builder 10 (July 1960), 48; and "Let's Gossip! Muscle Talk with a Personal Touch," Muscle Builder 10 (December 1960), 62.
65. Ibid.
66. A feature article on Shuey appears in Leroy Colbert, "Meet our New Mr. America—Gene Shuey," Mr. America 3 (May 1961), 9-12, 40-42. For Larry Scott's story see Loaded Guns (Salt Lake City: Larry Scott & Associates, 1991).
68. "Mammoth Mr. Universe---Mr. America Contest!" Muscle Builder 10 (July 1960), 48; and "Let's Gossip! Muscle Talk with a Personal Touch," Muscle Builder 10 (December 1960), 62.
69. Ibid.
75. Clem Pochmarn, "Mr. and Mrs. America," Muscle Builder 12 (July 1962), 9, 49. 76. Junior Mr. & Miss America Club Exercise Booklet, Payne personal scrapbook.
77. Interview with Payne. Later in life he owned a health spa in Healdsburg, California. At age fifty-seven, after losing some of his youthful vitality and suffering various aches and annoyances accompanying old age, he found relief in electro-magnetism and promoted a product called Electro Training Magnets. "Blood flows through your body seven complete times a day," he explained. "The magnets shake up the blood. And this allows your body to absorb nutrition better, eliminate waste better, and send oxygen to different parts of your body faster." Rich Mellott, "Jimmy Payne, A Guy With A Definite Attraction," Muscle World 4 (November 1983), 60, and "At 58, Jimmy Payne Discovers the Power of Electro-Magnetism and Regained the Incredible Strength and Endurance that Helped Him Become Mr. America!" Iron Man 44 (March 1985), 69.
78. Conversation with Payne.
Iron Game History: The Journal of Physical Culture

Iron Game History is published quarterly under the auspices of the H.J. Lutcher Stark Center for Physical Culture and Sports, a division of the Department of Kinesiology and Health Education at the University of Texas at Austin.

All profits from the sale of this journal will be used toward the improvement of Iron Game History and the systematic study of this field.

Subscription Rates:
Four Issues--$25.00  Eight Issues--$40.00

Foreign Subscriptions:
Four Issues--$30.00  Eight Issues--$45.00
Please remit in U.S. Funds.

McLean Fellowship Subscription--$60.00
Eight Issues and $20.00 donation to the H.J. Lutcher Stark Center

McLean Fellowship Patron Subscription--$100.00
Eight Issues plus a $60.00 donation to the H.J. Lutcher Stark Center

Please indicate type of subscription:
Four Issues (USA)   $25.00
Four Issues (Foreign)   $30.00
Eight Issues (USA)   $40.00
Eight Issues (Foreign)   $45.00
McLean Fellowship   $60.00
Patron   $100.00

Iron Game History
H.J. Lutcher Stark Center
NEZ 5.700, D3600
1 University Station
Austin, Texas 78712

Renewal? YES   NO

Name_________________________  Telephone_________________________
Street Address_________________________ City_________________________
State_________________________ Zipcode_________________________
Country_________________________ Email_________________________